



DEPARTMENT OF THE AIR FORCE
HEADQUARTERS AIR FORCE SERVICES AGENCY

January 6, 2009

MEMORANDUM FOR CDSU

FROM: SVCKH

SUBJECT: FOIA Appeal, Case FY2009-001

Attached is the full Team's Overall Assessment document requested by Mr. Thesing.

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Jose Saucedo Jr.", written over a printed name and title.

JOSE SAUCEDA JR.
Chief, Hospitality and Recreation Branch

Attachment:
Team's Overall Assessment

Chairman's Report
Technical Evaluation
Handicapped Golf Carts

1. Evaluation team met on July 29-30, 2008 for purpose of evaluating 3 proposals for Handicapped Golf Carts in compliance with DoD Policy letter dated 1 April 2008. Evaluation team consisted of:
 - a. Chairman: Eric Sudy
 - b. Team Leader/Evaluator: John Anderson
 - c. Evaluators:
 - (1) Bud Gentle
 - (2) Rick Boehm
 - (3) Trace Kea
 - (4) Gordon Zambrano

2. Proposals evaluated were from:
 - a. E-Z-Go Textron
 - b. Sunrise Mobility/Golf Xpress
 - c. SoloRider

3. Group Consensus Color Code Ratings - See Attached Spreadsheet

Technical Evaluation Factors

I. Safety Standards

- a. Electric Stand-Up Seat Force required for returning the seat to the forward position at 5, 10 and 15 degree slopes.
- b. Tipping Stability – the vehicle’s design must pass the two person golf car stability requirements of the American National Standards Institute (ANSI) Z130.1 – 1993 or Z130.1 – 1999.
 - i. Side to Side stability on a 40% grade (21.8 degree angle) When on the 21.8 degree slope if the player turns to the side, the player must remain at the 21.8 degrees and be able to turn to the driving position with a maximum 20-lbs pull.
 - ii. Front to Back stability on a 58% grade (30 degree angle).
 - iii. Must be tested with the advertised weight of the operator and should have a 50% safety factor.
- c. Speed, range, and reliability
 - i. Speed – Minimum top speed is to be 8 mph and a maximum of 12 mph.
 - ii. Ability to accelerate and decelerate slowly and smoothly
 - iii. Can the maximum speed of the car be adjusted?
 - iv. Car must be able to run for a minimum of 36 holes on a moderate terrain golf course.
- d. Seat Mobility
 - i. * Seat can be rotated by the driver 360 degrees and locked in at least 30 positions.
 - ii. * Height adjustment, minimum of 4” of travel that can be operated from a sitting position.
Forward and backward seat adjustment, minimum of 4” of travel that can be operated from a sitting position.
 - iii. Adjustable waist and chest safety belts to adequately secure the operator.
Armrest (optional). If provided, they must be movable so they can be out of the player’s way when swinging at the ball.
- e. Seat Release Mechanism - Ease in releasing the seat so it can be returned to a forward seating position.
- f. Steering
 - i. Steering is to be accomplished with a minimum amount of effort.
 - ii. Steering bar needs to have enough room for the operator to return to a forward seated position without interference from the steering bar.
 - iii. Turning radius of car
 - iv. Force and balance required steering on 5, 10, 15 degree slopes. Ease of steering on side hill lies is important because of the strength and balance challenges of the operator.
- g. Equipment and Device Holders
 - i. Include mounted brackets for securing an assistance device such as crutches and for securing a golf bag with a complete set of clubs.
 1. Visibility should not be obstructed by any of the devices or clubs.
 2. In the event of a wreck, ensure the position of the assistance devices and clubs can not cause severe injury to the driver.
 - ii. Safety switch allowing movement only when the seat is locked in a forward position.

** In reference to these evaluation requirements: All companies vying for the single rider golf car contract were unable to meet these proposed standards because they were not valid requirements, after the fact. (Vertical height adjustment was appropriately addressed in II.d) . Therefore it was the overall group consensus these factors be treated as neutral for all offerors.*

II. Operational Standards

- a. Car needs to be made so that all functions required to play golf and operate the vehicle can be done with the use of one hand.
 - i. Steering
 - ii. Acceleration
 - iii. Braking
 - 1. Full time regenerative braking recommended.
 - 2. Must be able to maintain any selected speed on a downhill slope.
 - 3. Car must not coast or freewheel.
 - 4. Parking brake must be automatically applied whenever the throttle in the off position or emergency brake is applied.
 - 5. The parking brake must hold securely on at least a 30% grade.
 - 6. Skid deterrent
 - iv. Emergency Stop – Should be located in an accessible location.
 - v. Key and control (forward/reverse switch) access and ease of operation.
 - vi. Operation of all levers and switches
- b. Placement and operation of all controls should be easily taught to new users.
- c. Car should provide easy accessibility from a wheelchair. Stable transfer bars to facilitate entry/exit to be secured to the car or driver's seat. If secured to driver seat, they shall move with the seat to allow for easy access from any seat location.
- d. The vertical height of the seat should be adjustable with the assistance of the golf course personnel to accommodate taller and shorter golfers.
- e. Warranty - Equal To or greater than a standard golf cart
 - i. Frame
 - ii. Power train
 - iii. Body Panels and Underbody
 - iv. All other components (i.e. Batteries, Suspension, etc.)
- f. Cart
 - i. Size – non-compact
 - ii. Weight, inclusive of batteries, causes an imprint on the turf.
 - iii. Load capacity of 350 lbs without a decrease in performance.
- g. Ride – The car must suppress severe buffeting to the driver whenever crossing rough terrain. Suspension should not create a diving board effect during the golf swing.
- h. Towing- manual release device to effect a freewheeling operation when towing.
- i. The golf bag needs to be located where the operator can easily access their clubs and not obstruct vision.
- j. Battery

- i. Major brand manufacturer battery readily available in all major cities.
- ii. A charger, per car, designed for use with batteries supplied.
- iii. The batteries must have an unobstructed access for easy servicing including checking water level and adding water.
- k. Service manual and operator instructions.
- l. Ground clearance addressing the positives and negatives concerning higher and lower ground clearance.

III. Service and Maintenance

- a. Manufacturer network
- b. Maintenance training
- c. Interchanging and availability of parts

IV. Organizational Past Performance - Past Performance is a measure of degree to which an offeror satisfied its customers in providing new handicapped accessible, single-rider golf carts. The NAFI may contact each offeror's customers to ask whether or not they believe that the:

- a. Offeror was capable, efficient, and effective;
- b. Offeror performance conformed to the terms and conditions of its contract;
- c. Offeror adhered to delivery schedules;
- d. Offeror was reasonable and cooperative during performance;
- e. Offeror was committed to customer satisfaction.

In evaluating past performance, the NAFI will contact the references provided by the offeror and will use other sources of information, including, but not limited to government agencies, better business bureau, and electronic data bases. Offerors must submit a list of references with points of contact and telephone number, minimum of 3, for projects of similar scope or complexity in the commercial recreational industry.

V. Delivery Requirements - Offeror must meet or exceed the following delivery requirements for the bases/phases outlined in Section J of the solicitation:

- a. Phase I requirements - delivery within 90 days from award;
- b. Phase II requirements - delivery within 120 days from award

VI. Value Added Items/Services: Offeror's to list any value added items or services to include a brief description of their advantages.

4. TEAM'S OVERALL ASSESSMENT:

A. Specific strengths, weaknesses, risk for offeror E-Z-Go Textron were:

(1) Strengths:

- Service and parts readily available at many E-Z-GO parts and service centers
- 6 volt batteries reduced replacement costs
- Many included accessories such as battery water fill tool and canopy.
- Strong network of service support through E-Z-GO dealerships worldwide

(2) Weaknesses:

- No chest belt
- Car did not appear to have a good build quality
- Knobby tires provide on car for evaluation left imprint on greens.

- Small width and height of tire left smaller and deeper imprint with rider on car while putting
- Canopy did not retract when seat moved into hitting position which required the golfer to adjust his swing into a flatter position
- Seat back did not move with the bottom of the seat when seat moved into a hitting position reducing backswing stability for the golfer
- Golf bag and clubs on the car rested in a vertical position in the front of the car which is not as easy to select a club and pull it up and out of the bag compared to the bag being tilted toward the driver
- Seat turn level was difficult to operate (perhaps because it was new)
- No extra accessory racks to hold crutches or ball retriever
- Operation controls such as forward/reverse, on/off, were located on the bottom right making it difficult to reach compared to being positioned in the center of the car
- Round steering wheel and associated car controls such as brakes and acceleration were more problematic for a disabled golfer

(3) Risk: Low

B. Specific strengths, weaknesses, risk for offeror Sunrise Mobility/Golf Xpress were:

(1) Strengths:

- Good outlay of controls such as on/off, forward/reverse and emergency stop
- Comfortable seat
- Extra safety bar near rear wheels assisted rider with little or no leg sensation from inadvertently placing their foot in a position that would cause injury under body or wheel
- Both lap and chest belts were included
- Quick and easily accessible "Emergency Stop" button
- Accessory rack for crutches, ball retriever, etc

(2) Weaknesses:

- Body/Frame did not have the appearance of quality
- Body, with a rider on the cart, especially a heavier rider, lowered substantially and the body touched the top of the tire
- No canopy was available which in sunny and hot locations would not be conducive to the rider
- Golf bag and clubs on the car rested in a vertical position in the front of the car which is not as easy to select a club and pull it up and out of the bag compared to the bag being tilted toward the driver
- When the seat was tilted for the rider in preparation in hitting a shot, the back of the seat remained at the same angle with the seat making it a little more difficult to properly turn the upper torso on the backswing
- Car may not have sufficient battery power to go 36 holes
- Daisy chain of micro switches could be problematic as well as beneficial
- Training documentation was unavailable and involved primarily phone calls
- Front portion of car (steering bar) was subject to being struck by club in forward swing
- Chest belt was leather and may be difficult to wash or clean
- Seat had to be perfectly aligned in neutral position (straight ahead) in order for the car to operate. Sensitivity and misplacement of proper angle prohibited car from operating on a couple of occasions. Did not feel as stable on slopes as other cars
- Battery accessibility appeared difficult
- When car came to a stop, the only way to start was to turn the ignition key off and then on again

(3) Risk: High. Small manufacturer that is dependent on a number of

subcontracted sources to fulfill car and parts orders. May face problematic issues in dealing with large orders. Started as a small company in the shopping cart business and has expanded into an adaptive car manufacturer and may bring a lower level of expertise to the market

C. Specific strengths, weaknesses, risk for offeror SoloRider were:

(1) Strengths:

- Built quality appeared excellent
- Accessory rack for crutches, ball retriever, etc
- Clubs were easily accessible because of tilted position
- Battery accessibility was extremely easy
- Chassis was developed by Club Car, and established golf car manufacturer
- When the seat was tilted for the rider in preparation in hitting a shot, the back of the seat tilted in an better angle to the seat allowing for proper torso support during the backswing
- Car was designed from the beginning as a vehicle for disabled golfers
- Custom designed suspension with four-corner coil-over shocks
- Large tires (found on regular golf cars) were standard and did not leave tire imprints on the green
- Tires are easily exchangeable with normal golf car tires
- Use of golf car tires and suspension made a smooth and stable ride like a normal golf car
- Canopy retracted when seat was moved in forward hitting position
- Canopy was easily removed or installed
- Seat had many stop and lock positions
- Lap and chest belts are provide
- Chest belt was made of scuba diving fabric making it flexible and washable
- Other optional accessories available for regular golf cars such as divot bottle, rake holder, club washer etc., were also available
- Training and operational manuals were good

(2) Weaknesses: Seat did not meet the forward/backward 4 inch requirement.

(3) Risk: Low

5. SUMMARY: Overall team findings: Offerors met the technical requirements of the solicitation and would be able to meet the performance requirements hereby listed in order of preference as recommended by the evaluation panel.

- A. Solo Rider – The Solo Rider car was of high design and build quality. The chassis makeup was that of a modern day normal golf car while the operator portion was specifically designed with a disabled golfer in mind. The retractable canopy was unique and easily installed and removed. It was deemed an important feature to provide needed shade for golfers in sunny locations. The ride quality and stability were unmatched. The provided safety belts were also superior. Of particular note was the easy and accessibility of the batteries. The car left no or minimal signs of wheel tracks on the greens and was rated highly for this factor. Solo Rider had custom designed suspension with four-corner coil-over shocks so that on uneven terrain, the swing arm suspension allows wheels to move in response to the terrain which kept wheels on the ground for traction and stability.
- B. E-Z-Go Textron - The Eagle Golf Car is backed by a strong network of dealerships and service centers however, this car did not appear to have as solid of a design and built quality as the Solo Rider. The offeror sited that they would be very flexible in making adjustments to the car to satisfy any request, such as moving the operator controls to a different position or two change the seat adjustment lever to the alternate side of the seat. The battery fill tool was an excellent value added accessory. The ride did not feel as stable or the batteries as easily accessible as the Solo Rider. The panel felt the steering wheel and controls were not as advantageous to the disabled golfer as the motorcycle styled bars on the other cars. The panel also felt the seat locking position were limited to 12 compared to the multitude of positions for the other two car seats.
- C. Sunrise Mobility/Golf Xpress – The panel was impressed with the car considering the small size of the manufacturer and that both of the competitors had research

SOURCE SELECTION SENSITIVE

and development assistance from established golf car companies. The car has some good features to include the seat, seat belts, and operator controls. The panel agreed the overall thought into the car was well done. Stability, although good, did not feel as solid as the others. The emergency stop button was very effective but the need to turn the ignition key every time the cart was moved was cumbersome.

The panels' main concern as indicated above is the high risk associated with its services and maintenance which may eventually be correctable but not within the timeframe associated with the urgency of this requirement.

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to be the initials 'EJ' followed by a stylized flourish.

Chairman, Technical Evaluation Team
Air Force Golf Program Manager

I. Safety Standards	Solo Rider	E-Z-GO	Sunrise
a. Electric Stand-Up Seat Force required for returning the seat to the forward position at 5, 10 and 15 degree slopes.	G	G	G
b. Tipping Stability			
i. Side to Side stability	G	G	G
ii. Front to Back stability on a 58% grade (30 degree angle).	G	G	G
iii. Must be tested with the advertised weight of the operator and should have a 50% safety factor.	G	G	G
c. Speed, range, and reliability			
i. Speed – Minimum top speed is to be 8 mph and a maximum of 12 mph.	G	G	G
ii. Ability to accelerate and decelerate slowly and smoothly	G	G	G
iii. Can the maximum speed of the car be adjusted?	G	G	G
iv. Car must be able to run for a minimum of 36 holes on a moderate terrain golf course.	G	G	G
d. Seat Mobility			
i. Seat can be rotated by the driver 360 degrees and locked in at least 30 positions.	N	N	N
ii. * Height adjustment, minimum of 4" of travel that can be operated from a sitting position.	N	N	N
* In reference to this evaluation requirement: All companies vying for the single rider golf car contract were unable to meet the proposed standard because it was not a valid requirement, after the fact. Vertical height adjustment was appropriately addressed in II.d . Therefore it was the overall group consensus this factor be treated as neutral for all offerors.			
iii. Forward and backward seat adjustment, minimum of 4" of travel that can be operated from a sitting position.	R	G	G
iv. Adjustable waist and chest safety belts to adequately secure the operator.	G	R	G
e. Seat Release Mechanism	G	G	B
f. Steering			
i. Steering is to be accomplished with a minimum amount of effort.	G	G	G
ii. Steering bar needs to have enough room for the operator to return to a forward seated position without interference from the steering bar.	G	G	G
iii. Turning radius of car	G	G	G
iv. Balance Steering	G	G	G
g. Equipment and Device Holders			
i. Include mounted brackets for securing an assistance device such as crutches and for securing a golf bag with a complete set of clubs.	G	Y	G
1. Visibility should not be obstructed by any of the devices or clubs.	G	G	G
2. In the event of a wreck, ensure the position of the assistance devices and clubs can not cause severe injury to the driver.	G	G	G
ii. Safety switch allowing movement only when the seat is locked in a forward position.	G	Y	G
II. Operational Standards			
a. Car needs to be made so that all functions required to play golf and operate the vehicle can be done with the use of one hand.			
i. Steering	G	G	G
ii. Acceleration	G	G	G
iii. Braking			
1. Full time regenerative braking recommended.	G	G	G
2. Must be able to maintain any selected speed on a downhill slope.	G	G	G
3. Car must not coast or freewheel.	G	G	G
4. Parking brake must be automatically applied whenever the throttle in the off position	G	Y	G
5. The parking brake must hold securely on at least a 30% grade.	G	G	G
6. Skid deterrent	G	B	G
iv. Emergency Stop – Should be located in an accessible location.	G	G	G
v. Key and control (forward/reverse switch) access and ease of operation.	G	G	Y
vi. Operation of all levers and switches	G	G	G

